Can Frankenstein be read as an early research ethics text?

In his article (Med Hum 2004;30:32–5), Davies asks whether Mary Shelley’s novel, Frankenstein, can be read as an early research ethics text. It is misguided to give the impression, as the author does at times, that Shelley was writing for a future institutional review board: there are reasons for believing that the novel’s theme of overreaching was a largely unintended rebuke to the fame-seeking writers who made her early life such a hell. But what one: her dead mother Mary Wollstonecraft, her father William Godwin, her husband Percy Shelley and her Geneva castellan Lord Byron. However, Davies’ partisanship on behalf of the novel finds confirmation in a recent publication by the French philosopher Dominique Lecour, in which Frankenstein, along with Goethe’s intricate verse-play Faust, is examined in the light of modern interpretations of the ancient myth of Prometheus. Indeed, the diversity of ways in which Mary Shelley’s novel can be interpreted – as a later version of the Faust myth, or an early version of the modern myth of the mad scientist; the id on the rampage, the proletariat running amok, or what happens when a man tries to have a baby without a woman – suggests that, for all its occasional crudity of structure, it is indeed one of the foundation texts of “a scientific futuromy” in which the cumulative effects of the lengthened reach of our deeds need to be observed, in view of our partial knowledge, by “an imaginative ‘heuristics of fear’”. Ethics, like Mary Shelley’s novel, ought to have a feel for the mythic too.

Can Frankenstein be read as an early research ethics text? [first appeared in German: 1979].

I Bamforth
86 rue Kempf, 67000 STRASBOURG, France;
lain@BAMFORTH@wanadoo.fr

Received 2 September 2004
Accepted for publication 28 September 2004

References

BOOK REVIEWS
A bumper review of fiction and poetry


Literature pays attention to the smallest, most significant details of how people are, can be, and have been: in the ways they relate to each other, individually, socially, and to our world. It forms a channel between the reader, and the closely observed. Since literary authors include some of our best doctors, and the effects those relationships can be a gripping and memorable way to communicate what they have deduced and how they have interpreted this raw observational data, using the full panoply of literary devices such as narrative, metaphor, plot, and characterisation. Their skill lies precisely in making the process of deep learning thoroughly enjoyable: we learn best when enjoying the process.

Davies asks whether Mary Shelley’s novel, which is systematically and characteristically a novel of psychological oddities and aberrations. This book jacket asserts; her skill is in depicting those relationships, will be invaluable to any clinician or student. Coulehan’s Chekhov’s Doctors presents an extraordinary kaleidoscope of doctors in medical and social contexts. I read it straight through, but the stories would also repay being read separately. Chekhov’s observation of detail, both of character and place, is precise, building up vivid pictures and portrayals, immersing the reader in nineteenth-century Russia: a different world from ours. They mostly are not really stories, but studies of character and situation, raising many questions as they answer. The introduction and Coulehan’s commentaries are succinctly useful. A book to read and mull over, and a place to learn what adversity can do to human clinicians and their patients. Another doctor/writer says: “My early answers to the question what is healing came from these stories. I still have a piece of an envelope on which I copied part of a letter Chekhov wrote to an editor who had criticised his history, Ward Number Six, [included in Coulehan’s collection]: The best of writers are realistic and describe life as it is, but because each line is saturated with the consciousness of its goal, you feel life as it should be in addition to life as it is, and you are captivated by it.” Life as it should be in addition to life as it is.

Those who read little fiction really do need guidance and support when choosing contemporary texts, they are so varied in quality. Jane Rogers and Lesley Glaiser are reliably worth reading, as much as anything for their observation of how people relate to each other, and the effects those relationships can have. Glaiser’s novels are not horror as the book jacket asserts; her skill is in depicting psychological oddities and aberrations. This book is as deliciously bizarre as her other eight, offering deep insight into a psychiatrist’s life, and the way people can become willing victims.

Jane Rogers’s books are deep psychological studies. The Independent reviewer asserted: “she writes better than almost anyone of her generation”, and went on to say that her books were so carefully plotted and the characters so believable in spite of strange happenings. The Voyage Home involves the child of a missionary trying to make sense of her past, her parents, and her own sexuality. If you want to understand people better (as anyone in medicine and health care must), read Jane Rogers.

Something Beginning With is a stunning first novel. Salway’s academic reading of Chekhov’s work fascinates any reader, not just the clinician.

Cecil Helman has gathered together literary wealth. Clinician readers with little time can be certain of encountering writings focused toward their interests and needs here. The collection includes stories about and by doctors, clinical encounters, and personal patient accounts such as Rachel Clark’s description of her cancer—so harrowing in so young a girl. Arthur Conan Doyle and Sacks are included, as is Kafka’s complex and clever story about a country doctor. This collection, with Helman’s insightful introduction and notes, will be invaluable to anyone running a medicine and literature course, as well as in situ learning for any clinician or student.


www.medicalhumanities.com
collaboration with Survivors Poetry. This dynamic organisation, run by and for survivors of mental illness, coordinates self-help writing groups, and publishes a support magazine. This collection, including Rimbaud, Shakespeare, Stevie Smith, Andrew Motion, and six Survivors members, gives great insight into depression and trauma. Many individual poems could be photocopied and given to patients to foster hope and understanding. Several of them turned me round from a dark moment, moving me to tears.

*Attending to the Fact—Staying with Dying*, a poetry collection by a hospice trustee and hospice chaplain, is deeply moving and accessible. Offering insight into the dying process, as well as the difficulties and problems of working with the dying, it should be on the desk of everyone who works with dying people in any capacity. *Keeping Mum* is a psychiatric detective story, or requiem in poetry, for the dying language, Welsh. Gwyneth Lewis, who writes in both Welsh and English, eloquently mourns her Welsh. Gwyneth Lewis, who writes in both Welsh and English, eloquently mourns her

These books will help you through the long dark evenings ahead (odd to write: my fingers melting on the keyboard in July heat). A further help might be to belong to a reading group. Responses and reactions can be shared: all equally valid whoever you are, and however varied they are. Bonnebaker, reporting a hospital based reading and discussion programme in America, says: “As one physician noted: ‘I’m amazed by how differently we read these books. It makes me wonder how differently we hear our patient’s stories. And how our patients perceive us.’” Indeed. Whatever body or “mind-formed mana-"..."selves"..."...", you or your patients suffer from, you will find them in these books. Books are “well born. Derived from people, but also from radiance, heights.”

G Bolton  
Medicine and the Arts, King’s College London University, Department of English, Strand, London, WC2R 2LS, UK; gillie.bolton@kcl.ac.uk

References  
1 Shem S. Fiction as resistance. (Medical writings: physician/writers’ reflections on their work) Ann Intern Med 2002;137:934–7 at 934.  
3 Blake W. In: Forbes P, ed. We have come through. 2003.  
4 Miloss C. In: Forbes P, ed. We have come through. 2003.  

Compassion’s Way: a Doctor’s Quest into the Soul of Medicine  
This book is a set of anecdotes, stories, travelogues, film and book reviews, essays and even fairy tales. All of these are representative of Ralph Crawshaw’s work, which has been published over a period of about 35 years, and they have been skilfully edited into eleven sections covering a broad range of topics. The collection is compelling read-..."...", the book makes for easy reading. The eighty one individual chapters are short (about two to twenty pages), so it is easy to fit in a chapter between activities or at bedtime. As a reviewer, I felt compelled to read the entire book and my motivation to keep reading was maintained by the content. It was certainly not soporific. As an introduction to the book, the author gives a brief outline of his relatively humble origins. His family, educational, and military experiences give the reader a reasonable understanding of his roots and what may have shaped his professional life and thoughts along the lines reflected in this work. The main message of the book concerns the close relationship that exists between doctor and patient. Compassion is expressed as far more than a concept, being an experience which involves the deeper aesthetic values of both doctor and patient; the doctor has to contribute faith, hope, and charity, all present-..."...", with the patient has to reciprocate with trust. He relates very clearly the many factors which can intrude to break up this relationship. These include technology (which should be a tool and not the dictator it has often come to represent), as well as economic factors, age, social status, and many others. Actions should be weighed up as to who benefits most, the patient, or third parties. Although acknowledging that the sanctity of personal interactions should always be respected, the author relays many stories illustrating the important need for social responsibility. These are collected from his experiences across many cultures (including communist Russia, China, India, South Africa, the United Kingdom, and Mexico, as well as his native USA). Many of these experiences are very moving and thought provoking. The frustration resulting from inequity of standards and access to health care for these family, educational, and military experiences add credibility to their validity. If there are any criticisms: the book could have been a little shorter and some minor repetitions could have been avoided. If, however, the book is read as a smorgasbord (as advised by the author), this criticism is negated. Some of the film reviews are perhaps a little esoteric and tangential, but whenever I thought this, the next review turned out to be a real gem, rich in thought and insight into the humanities and psychology. The references are useful. Although many of the chapters were published as articles 30 years ago, the topics are evergreen and are still applicable today.

We would find this book most interesting: everyone who deals with people as individuals, and indeed, also those who deal with population groups because they too need to appreciate what is required when dealing with individuals. The book would include doctors, medical students, nurses, other ancillary medical staff, and pastors and chaplains; the second group would include managers (especially those in the health field) and politicians and personnel who help to shape health policy. Many of the chapters would provide wonderful material for discussion groups (at either undergraduate or postgraduate level) to do with medical ethics, professional attitudes, and even civic or social policy. The real life experiences add credibility to their validity. While not all readers would necessarily agree with Ralph Crawshaw’s views, there seems to be little doubt that the book offers a better understanding of our human condition. The world would be a much happier and safer place if the way of compassion was followed.

G Barbezat  
gil.barbezat@stonebow.otago.ac.nz

Meet Humanities: first published as on December 6, 2004. Downloaded from http://www.medicalhumanities.com on January 14, 2022 by guest. Protected by copyright.
Association for Medical Humanities – Third Annual Conference

Peninsula Medical School, Truro, Cornwall 10-12th July 2005

This is to give generous notice of this conference and a preliminary call for papers. Abstracts are invited for 15 minute papers on topics related to the medical humanities. The organisers of the conference welcome contributions from all healthcare staff, academics and clinicians, and from those working in the medical humanities. The themes for this conference are:

- Narrative interpretations of practice, particularly narratives of music, film, and visual art
- Medical humanities and the education of healthcare practitioners
- Medical ethics
- The medical humanities and changes in clinical practice

Abstracts of no more than 300 words should be submitted by email on a pro forma. This should be available on the AMH website, currently under construction, or from Dr Robert Marshall, robert.marshall@rcht.cornwall.nhs.uk

The deadline is 15th April. Further details of the conference are available on the website or from Dr Marshall.